

# AVAILABILITY AND QUALITY OF EMERGENCY OBSTETRIC CARE AMONG HEALTH FACILITIES IN ETHIOPIA

## AYELE GELETO BALI BSC (UNIVERSITY OF GONDAR); MPH (HARAMAYA UNIVERSITY)

## SUPERVISORS: DOCTOR CATHERINE CHOJENTA PROFESSOR DEBORAH LOXTON

Research Centre for Generational Health and Ageing,
School of Medicine and Public Health, Faculty of Health and Medicine
The University of Newcastle, Australia.

A Thesis Submitted in Fulfilment of the Requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Reproductive Medicine

November 2020
The University of Newcastle, Australia

#### **DECLARATIONS**

### Statement of originality

"I hereby certify that the work embodied in this thesis is my own work, conducted under normal supervision. The thesis contains no material which has been accepted, or is being examined, for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made. I give consent to the final version of my thesis being made available worldwide when deposited in the University's Digital Repository, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968 and any approved embargo".

Ayele Geleto Bali

11 November 2020

**Statement of collaboration** 

"I hereby certify that the work embodied in this thesis has been done in collaboration with other

researchers. I have included as part of the thesis a statement clearly outlining the extent of

collaboration, with whom and under what auspices".

<u>Ayele Geleto Bali</u>

11 November 2020

ii

Statement of authorship

I hereby certify that the work embodied in this thesis contains published papers of which I am a

corresponding author. I have included as part of this thesis a written statement, endorsed by all of the

co-authors, attesting to my contribution to the joint publications.

<u>Ayele Geleto Bali</u>

11 November 2020

iii

#### Thesis by publication

I hereby certify that this thesis is in the form of a series of papers. I have included as part of the thesis a written declaration from each co-author, endorsed in writing by the Faculty Assistant Dean (Research Training), attesting to my contribution to any jointly authored papers.

Ayele Geleto Bali

11 November 2020

#### Co-authors' statement

By signing below, I confirm that <u>Ayele Geleto Bali</u> contributed [conceptualization, proposal development, data collection, analysis and interpretation and manuscript writing] to the papers/publications detailed below.

- 1. **Ayele Geleto,** Catherine Chojenta, Abdulbasit Musa, Deborah Loxton. Barriers to access and utilization of emergency obstetric care at health facilities in sub-Saharan Africa—a systematic review protocol. *BMC Systematic Reviews* (2018) 7:60.
- 2. **Ayele Geleto**, Catherine Chojenta, Abdulbasit Musa, Deborah Loxton. Barriers to access and utilization of emergency obstetric care at health facilities in sub-Saharan Africa—a systematic review of literature. *BMC Systematic Reviews (2018) 7:183*.
- 3. **Ayele Geleto,** Catherine Chojenta, Abdulbasit Musa, Deborah Loxton. WOMEN's Knowledge of Obstetric Danger signs in Ethiopia (WOMEN's KODE): a systematic review and meta-analysis. *BMC Systematic Reviews (2019)*, 8:63.
- 4. **Ayele Geleto**, Catherine Chojenta, Tefera Taddele, Deborah Loxton. Incidence of maternal near miss among women in labour admitted to hospitals in Ethiopia. *Midwifery: March 2020 Volume 82, 102597*.
- 5. Ayele Geleto, Catherine Chojenta, Tefera Taddele and Deborah Loxton. Association between maternal mortality and caesarean section in Ethiopia: a national cross-sectional study. BMC Pregnancy and Childbirth (2020) 20:588.
- 6. **Ayele Geleto**, Catherine Chojenta, Tefera Taddele, Deborah Loxton. Magnitude and determinants of the direct obstetric case fatality rates among women admitted to hospitals in Ethiopia. *BMC Pregnancy and Childbirth (2020) 20:130*.
- 7. **Ayele Geleto**, Catherine Chojenta, Tefera Taddele, Deborah Loxton. Perceptions of midwives on the quality of emergency obstetric care at hospitals in Ethiopia: A qualitative explanatory study. *Midwifery: November 2020, Volume 90, 102814*.

iv

Table 1: Co-authors statement

Co-author	<b>Publications</b>	Signature	Date
Catherine Chojenta	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6 & 7		10/11/2020
Deborah Loxton	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6 & 7		10/11/2020
Abdulbasit Musa	1, 2 & 3		10/11/2020
Tefera Taddele	4, 5, 6 & 7		10/11/2020

## Assistant Dean Research Training, Faculty of Health and Medicine

Name: A/Prof Lesley MacDonald-Wicks

Signature:

Date: 11th November 2020

Ayele Geleto Bali 11 November 2020

#### Thesis publications

- 1. **Ayele Geleto,** Catherine Chojenta, Abdulbasit Musa, Deborah Loxton. Barriers to access and utilization of emergency obstetric care at health facilities in sub-Saharan Africa—a systematic review protocol. *BMC Systematic Reviews* (2018) 7:60.
- 2. **Ayele Geleto**, Catherine Chojenta, Abdulbasit Musa, Deborah Loxton. Barriers to access and utilization of emergency obstetric care at health facilities in sub-Saharan Africa—a systematic review of literature. *BMC Systematic Reviews* (2018) 7:183.
- 3. **Ayele Geleto,** Catherine Chojenta, Abdulbasit Musa, Deborah Loxton. WOMEN's Knowledge of Obstetric Danger signs in Ethiopia (WOMEN's KODE): a systematic review and meta-analysis. *BMC Systematic Reviews* (2019), 8:63.
- Ayele Geleto, Catherine Chojenta, Tefera Taddele, Deborah Loxton. Incidence of maternal near miss among women in labour admitted to hospitals in Ethiopia. *Midwifery: March 2020 Volume 82*, 102597.
- Ayele Geleto, Catherine Chojenta, Tefera Taddele and Deborah Loxton. Association between maternal mortality and caesarean section in Ethiopia: a national cross-sectional study. BMC Pregnancy and Childbirth (2020) 20:588.
- Ayele Geleto, Catherine Chojenta, Tefera Taddele and Deborah Loxton. Magnitude and determinants of obstetric case fatality rate among women with the direct causes of maternal deaths in Ethiopia: a national cross-sectional study. BMC Pregnancy and Childbirth (2020) 20:130.
- 7. **Ayele Geleto**, Catherine Chojenta, Tefera Taddele, Deborah Loxton. Perceptions of midwives on the quality of emergency obstetric care at hospitals in Ethiopia: A qualitative explanatory study. *Midwifery: November 2020, Volume 90, 102814*, (Appendix X).

Avele Geleto Bali

11 November 2020

Permissions of use

I warrant that I have obtained, where necessary, permission from the copyright owners to use any of

my own published work (e.g. journal articles) in which the copyright is held by another party (e.g.

publisher, co-author). The copyright and license agreement for all chapters can be found in Appendix

XIV.

Ayele Geleto Bali

11 November 2020

vii

#### Other thesis-related outcomes

#### Journal articles

- 1. Chaltu Yasin, **Ayele Geleto** and Yemane Berhane. Referral linkage among public health facilities in Ethiopia: A qualitative explanatory study of facilitators and barriers for emergency obstetric referral in Addis Ababa city administration. *Midwifery* 79 (2019) 102528.
- 2. Abdulbasit Musa, Catherine Chojenta, **Ayele Geleto** and Deborah Loxton. The associations between intimate partner violence and maternal health care service utilization: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *BMC Women's Health (2019) 19:36*

#### **Conferences**

- 1. **Ayele Geleto,** Catherine Chojenta, Abdulbasit Musa, Deborah Loxton. WOMEN's Knowledge of Obstetric Danger signs in Ethiopia (WOMEN's KODE): a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Ethiopian Public Health Association, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia, during February 26-28/2018 (Oral presentation).*
- Ayele Geleto, Catherine Chojenta, Tefera Taddele, Deborah Loxton. Magnitude and determinants
  of the direct obstetric case fatality rates among women admitted to hospitals in Ethiopia. Ethiopian
  Society of Obstetrics and Gynaecology, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia, during February 16-18/2020 (Oral
  presentation).

#### Courses and trainings attended

- ➤ Biostatistics A (6910)
- ➤ Biostatistics B (6920)
- ➤ Categorical Data Management and Generalized Linear Model (6940)
- > Qualitative Methods in Health Research (6210)
- > Epidemiology A Basic Methods (6420)
- ➤ Clinical Epidemiology (6410)
- Basic and advanced NVivo training
- > Introduction to EndNote
- ➤ RCGHA language support classes
- > RCGHA WWOMB classes

Ayele Geleto Bali 11 November 2020

## **Conflict of interest**

"I hereby declare that there are no conflicts of interests."

Ayele Geleto Bali

11 November 2020

#### **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

First, and most importantly, I would like to thank my almighty God for helping me at all stages of my journey to reach this level in my career. Next, I would like to acknowledge the Australian government and the University of Newcastle for providing me with a full scholarship to study my PhD. My special thanks go to the Deputy Vice-Chancellor (Research and Innovation) for their partial support of this research project. I would like to extend my heartfelt acknowledgements to my supervisors, Doctor Catherine Chojenta and Professor Deborah Loxton, for their invaluable contributions throughout my PhD study that represents a milestone in my career. Your tremendous support and guidance throughout my study assisted me to realise my career dream. My PhD, which would have been impossible to achieve without your help and close supervision.

Dear Cath, I remember my happiness when you accepted my request to supervise my PhD study at the University of Newcastle—an internationally recognised university. Your first response to my request, which was very positive and welcoming, encouraged me to finalise my application for admission as an international student under your supervision. I understand that it is difficult to accept a supervision request from someone whom you do not know in person. However, you were optimistic about me and accepted my supervision request without hesitation—thank you very much for believing in me. My gratitude for your patience and continuous motivation to improve my research skills throughout my studies is immense. Thank you, Cath, for encouraging me to grow as a researcher throughout my PhD career. I learned much from your positive feedback, incredible advice, dedication and timely responses to each of my requests. I appreciate all the professional advice you provided throughout my study—all I can do is say 'thank you', sincerely.

Deb, I would like to thank you for your continuous support and dedicated professional mentoring, guidance and encouragement, which have shaped me to become what I am today. Your invaluable comments and advice throughout every step of my study have helped me to grow professionally. Crucially, you shaped me to become a researcher who confidently works for the improvement of public health. Your mature and professional guidance assisted me to enrich all papers included in this research project and to improve all aspects of the thesis. The support you gave me during my work cannot be repaid—only with thanks, and this is beyond expressing with words. You motivated me to work and shaped the ways I can and will contribute to the field of public health. You were always there to assist me with any aspect of the research project, with no restrictions on time and place. Your positive outlook and confidence in my research inspired me greatly and gave me further courage. I cannot express how much you have helped me—you are special to me.

In my research, I used a representative national dataset available at the Ethiopian Public Health Institute; I wish to extend my special gratitude to the Ethiopian Public Health Institute for their permission to access the secondary data used in Chapters 6 through 8. I would like to thank the researchers who conducted the national survey titled 'Assessment of emergency obstetric and newborn care in Ethiopia'

for their dedication and commitment during the data collection period. I would also like to extend my appreciation to the participating hospitals, data collectors, supervisors and partners who cooperated during the data collection process, in addition to those who funded the 'national survey'. I also thank the interviewers, supervisors and the participants of the qualitative study for their cooperation during data collection.

I extend my thanks to the Faculty librarian, Debbie Booth, for her supportive and friendly contributions during the literature review, which was used throughout this study. I would like to thank Doctor Ryan O'Neill and Natalia Soeters for reviewing this document for English language usage and the proofreading of the manuscripts included in this study. My heartfelt thanks go to all staff of the Research Centre for Generational Health and Aging, School of Medicine and Public Health, for all the continuous support they provided me with, especially Ryan Tuckerman for IT support and Katherine Tuckerman and Clare Thomson for administration support. Finally, yet importantly, I also appreciate Haramaya University for facilitating my study by providing me with study leave. Capstone Editing provided copyediting and proofreading services, according to the guidelines laid out in the university-endorsed national 'Guidelines for Editing Research Theses'.

I would also like to thank my family. Most importantly, my mum experienced discomfort when I was away from her; she always prays for my security. She cried when I began my time abroad for study. Mum, I have no words to express my gratitude to you for the sacrifices you have made for me since my childhood. Thank you very much for your unconditional love and consistent support throughout my life. Thanks, Dad, for your support and consistent help throughout my career development, although I did not have the chance to see you alive during this final stage of my career. Dad, I have only three words to say at this stage: 'Rest in peace'. Thank you to all my brothers and sisters and all family members—your encouragement and prayers helped me during the difficult times. Finally, I wholeheartedly thank my lovely wife, Amerti. During my study, Amuu has been overburdened by caring for our kids, Webi and Beritina, in addition to her own work and study. Your encouragement, support and prayers strengthened me to finish my PhD. Altogether, you are the reason for my success. Webi and Beritina, I was usually relieved of tension and depression when we had our video chats. Your farewell ceremonies when I was leaving for Australia, although you had no chance to travel with me, were unforgettable. You often waved your hands while I was crossing the borderline (entering the airport) and you held flowers to welcome me upon my returns—these moments were unforgettable and well appreciated. Thank you, my kids, for those incredible events.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

DECLARATIONS	i
Statement of originality	i
Statement of collaboration	ii
Statement of authorship	iii
Thesis by publication	iv
Thesis publications	vi
Permissions of use	vii
Other thesis-related outcomes	viii
Conflict of interest	ix
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	X
LIST OF TABLES	xx
LIST OF FIGURES	xxii
ABBREVIATIONS	xxiii
ABSTRACT	xxv
CHAPTER 1: GENERAL INTRODUCTION	1
1.1. Introduction	1
1.1.1. Maternal mortality	1
1.1.2. Maternal near miss	3
1.1.3. Obstetric complications	4
1.1.4. Maternal health services	6
1.1.5. Emergency obstetric care	8
1.2. Profile of Ethiopia, the study setting	11
1.2.1. General information	11
1.2.2. Geography and climate	11
1.2.3. Socio-economic conditions	12
1.2.4. Health services delivery system	13
1.2.5. Maternal health services coverage	14
1.3 Problem statement	16

	1.4.	Theoretical framework of the study	17
	1.4.1.	The Three Delays Model	17
	1.5.	Organisation of the thesis	18
C	HAPTI	ER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW	21
	2.1.	Section overview	21
	2.2.	Indicators of monitoring emergency obstetric care	21
	2.2.1.	The availability of emergency obstetric care	22
	2.2.2.	Geographical distribution of emergency obstetric care	23
	2.2.3.	Deliveries conducted at emergency obstetric care facilities	23
	2.2.4.	Met need for emergency obstetric care	24
	2.2.5.	Deliveries conducted by caesarean section	25
	2.2.6.	The direct obstetric case fatality rate	27
	2.3.	Determinants of the utilisation of emergency obstetric care	29
	2.3.1.	The availability of emergency obstetric care	29
	2.3.2.	The geographic accessibility of emergency obstetric care facilities	30
	2.3.3.	The acceptability of emergency obstetric care services	30
	2.3.4.	The affordability of emergency obstetric care services	31
	2.3.5.	Knowledge of obstetric danger signs determines utilisation of the services	32
	2.4.	Knowledge of healthcare providers about EmOC	33
	2.5.	Conclusions	34
	2.6.	Research aims	36
	2.6.1.	General aim	36
	2.6.2.	Specific aims	36
C	HAPTI	ER 3: BARRIERS TO ACCESS AND UTILIZATION OF EMERGENCY OBSTET	ΓRIC
		T HEALTH FACILITIES IN SUB-SAHARAN AFRICA: A SYSTEMATIC REVIEW	
L		TURE	
	3.1.	Section overview	
	3.2.	Background	
	3.3.	Methods	
	3.3.1.	Data sources and Search strategy	40

3.3.2.	Eligibility criteria	40
3.3.3.	Exclusion criteria.	41
3.3.4.	Screening of the articles	41
3.3.5.	Quality appraisal	41
3.3.6.	Data extraction	41
3.3.7.	Data synthesis	41
3.4.	Results	42
3.4.1.	Characteristics of the included studies.	43
3.4.2.	Barriers to seeking emergency obstetric care.	43
3.5.	Discussion.	51
3.6.	Conclusions	54
	ER 4: WOMEN'S KNOWLEDGE OF OBSTETRIC DANGER SIGNS IN ETHIOP N'S KODE): A SYSTEMATIC REVIEW AND META-ANALYSIS	
4.1.	Section overview	55
4.2.	Background	56
4.3.	Methods	58
4.3.1.	Data source and search strategy	58
4.3.2.	Inclusion and exclusion criteria	58
4.3.3.	Screening of the articles	59
4.3.4.	Data Extraction.	59
4.3.5.	Quality and Risk of bias assessment	59
4.3.6.	Outcome measure and data synthesis	59
4.3.7.	Subgroup analysis	60
4.4.	Results	60
4.5.1.	Characteristics of the included studies	60
4.5.2.	Pooled meta-analysis in different outcome categories	63
4.5.3.	Factors affecting Knowledge of women about obstetric danger signs	67
	authors asked "are you satisfied with the service you received today" to assessed level	
4.6.	Discussion	69

4.7.	Conclusions	72
СНАРТ	TER 5: METHODS	74
5.1.	Section overview	74
5.2.	Methods employed in the 2016 Ethiopia Emergency Obstetric and Newborn Care survey.	76
5.2.1.	Study setting	76
5.2.3.	Study population	76
5.2.4.	Data collection instruments	79
5.2.5.	Data collection	79
5.2.6.	Data collectors	79
5.2.7.	Variables measured by the Ethiopian Public Health Institute	80
5.3.	Methods for Studies 3–5	80
5.3.3.	Variables used in Studies 3–5	81
5.3.4.	Data analysis	82
5.3.5.	Ethical approval	84
5.4.	Methods for the qualitative study (Study 6)	84
5.4.1.	Study setting and period	84
5.4.2.	Study design	85
5.4.3.	Justification of the qualitative study	85
5.4.4.	Study participants	86
5.4.5.	Inclusion and exclusion criteria	87
5.4.6.	Data collection	87
5.4.7.	Data quality control	88
5.4.8.	Data analysis	88
5.4.9.	Phases of Braun and Clarke's thematic analysis	89
5.4.10	. Rigour of the study	90
5.4.11	. Ethical approvals and considerations	91
5.5.	Summary	92
СНАРТІ	ER 6: INCIDENCE OF MATERNAL NEAR MISS AMONG WOMEN IN LABOU	UR
<b>ADMIT</b>	FED TO HOSPITALS IN ETHIOPIA	93

	6.1.	Section overview	93
	6.2.	Background	94
	6.3.	Methods	96
	6.3.1.	Study area and period	96
	6.3.2.	Study participants	96
	6.3.3.	Inclusion criteria	96
	6.3.4.	Data collection process	96
	6.3.5.	Operational definitions	98
	6.3.6.	Data analysis	98
	6.4.	Results	99
	6.4.1.	Magnitude of obstetric complications and maternal deaths	99
	6.4.2.	Maternal near miss indicators	. 103
	6.5.	Discussion	. 105
	6.5.1.	Causes of maternal near miss	. 105
	6.5.2.	Maternal near miss indicators	. 106
	6.6.	Conclusions	. 107
C	НАРТЕ	ER 7: ASSOCIATION BETWEEN MATERNAL MORTALITY AND CAESARI	EAN
S	ECTIO1	N IN ETHIOPIA: A HOSPITAL-BASED NATIONAL CROSS-SECTIONAL STUDY	. 109
	7.1.	Section overview	. 109
	7.2.	Background	. 110
	7.3.	Methods	. 111
	7.3.1.	Study Area and period	. 111
	7.3.2.	Study participants	. 112
	7.3.3.	Inclusion criteria	. 113
	7.3.4.	Nature of the data	. 113
	7.3.5.	Operational definitions	. 114
	7.3.6.	Data analysis	. 114
	7.4.	Results	. 114
	7.4.1.	Obstetric complications and maternal deaths	. 114

7.4.2	Regional distribution of maternal mortality ratios	5
7.4.3	Regional distribution of caesarean section rates	6
7.4.4	Causes of death among women who had caesarean section	7
7.4.5	Distribution of caesarean section rates and maternal mortality ratios by region 11	8
7.4.6	Association of MMRs and caesarean section rates	9
7.5.	Discussion	2
7.6.	Conclusion	4
AMON	TER 8: MAGNITUDE AND DETERMINANTS OF OBSTETRIC CASE FATALITY RATE G WOMEN WITH DIRECT CAUSES OF MATERNAL DEATHS IN ETHIOPIA: A	A
NATIO	NAL CROSS-SECTIONAL STUDY	6
8.1.	Section overview	6
8.2.	Background	7
8.3.	Methods	8
8.3.1	Study Area and period	8
8.3.2	Study participants	8
8.3.3	Inclusion and exclusion criteria	8
8.3.4	Nature of the data	8
8.3.5	Operational definitions	9
8.3.6	Data analysis	9
8.3.7	Ethical Clearance	0
8.4.	Results	0
8.4.1	Hospitals characteristics	0
8.4.2	Direct obstetric complications and associated maternal deaths	2
8.4.3	Regional variations in the Direct Obstetric Case Fatality Rate	4
8.4.4	Determinants of the Direct Obstetric Case Fatality Rate among hospitals	4
8.5.	Discussion	7
8.6.	Conclusions	9
СНАРТ	ER 9: PERCEPTIONS OF MIDWIVES ON THE QUALITY OF EMERGENCY OBSTETRI	C
CARE A	AT HOSPITALS IN ETHIOPIA: A QUALITATIVE EXPLANATORY STUDY 14	0
9.1.	Section overview	<u>.</u> 0

	9.2.	Background	141
	9.3.	Methods	142
	9.3.1.	Study setting and period	142
	9.3.2.	Study design	143
	9.3.3.	Study participants	143
	9.3.4.	Inclusion and exclusion criteria.	143
	9.3.5.	Data collection	143
	9.3.6.	Procedural rigour	144
	9.3.7.	Data analysis	144
	9.3.8.	Trustworthiness of the study	144
	9.4.	Results	145
	9.4.1.	Characteristics of the respondents	145
	9.4.2.	Thematic analysis	146
	9.5.	Discussion	153
	9.6.	Conclusions	156
C	HAPTE	ER 10: DISCUSSION	157
	10.1.	Section overview	157
	10.2.	The Three Delays Model	158
	10.2.1.	The first delay: The decision to seek care	159
	10.2.2.	The second delay: Reaching the health facility	161
	10.2.3.	The third delay: Receiving care in the facility	161
	10.3.	Maternal health outcomes	164
	10.4.	Strengths and limitations of the study	166
	10.4.1.	Strengths	166
	10.4.2.	Limitations	167
	10.5.	Implications for future research	168
	10.6.	Implications for policy and practice	169
	10.7.	Summary	171
	10.8.	Conclusions	172

References	174
Appendices	193
Appendix I: Glossary	193
Appendix II: Participant Information Statement, English version	198
Appendix III: Interview Guide for qualitative study, English version	204
Appendix IV: Participant Information Statement, local language	207
Appendix V: Interview Guide for qualitative study, local language	212
Appendix VI: Language translation certificate	215
Appendix VII: Recruitment flier	216
Appendix VIII: Letter of ethical approval from the Human Research Ethics Committee	ee of the
University of Newcastle.	217
Appendix IX: Letter of ethical approval from the IRB-EPHI-SERO	223
Appendix X: Published articles	224
Appendix XI: Supplementary material for Chapter 3	297
Appendix XII: Supplementary material for Chapter 4	301
Appendix XIII: Invoice and the receipt for the grant won for publication	303
APPENDIX XIV: License agreement, Rights and permissions for published articles	305

## LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1: World Health Organization's process indicators, definitions and acceptable level of
indicators for monitoring EmOC
Table 3.1: Thematic summary of barriers to access and utilization of EmOC in different Sub-Saharan
Africa
Table 4.1: Characteristics of the studies included in this systematic review
Table 4.2: Factors affecting women's knowledge of obstetric danger signs in Ethiopia
Table 5.1: Summary of the methods applied for each aims of the thesis
Table 5.2: Number of health facilities by facility type, region, and managing authority, that were
included in the Ethiopia EmONC survey, 2016
Table 5.3: Regional distribution of hospitals included in the 2016 Ethiopia EmONC survey
Table 6.1: The world health organization maternal near miss definition criteria
Table 6.2: Operational definitions of the technical terms used throughout the paper
Table 6.3: Magnitude of obstetric complications and severe maternal outcomes among hospitals in
Ethiopia, 2015
Table 6.4: Regional distribution of hospitals in Ethiopia by the provision of EmOC functions, 2015
Table 6.5: Regional distributions of incidence of maternal near miss among hospitals in Ethiopia, 2015
Table 7.1: Regional distribution of hospitals in the 2016 Ethiopian EmONC survey
Table 7.2: Obstetric complications and maternal deaths in Ethiopian hospitals in 2015
Table 7. 3: Regional distribution of maternal mortality ratios among hospitals in Ethiopia, 2015 116
Table 7.4: Regional distribution of caesarean section rates among hospitals in Ethiopia, 2015 117
Table 7.5: Distribution of caesarean section rates and maternal mortality ratios among hospitals in
Ethiopia by regions, 2015
Table 7. 6: The correlation coefficient for maternal mortality ratios and caesarean section rates among
Ethiopian regions, 2015
Table 8.1: Characteristics of hospitals included in the study, Ethiopia, 2015
Table 8.2: Magnitude of direct obstetric complications and associated maternal death among hospitals
in Ethiopia, 2015
Table 8.3: Regional distribution of direct obstetric case fatality rate among hospitals in Ethiopia, 2015
Table 8.4: Unadjusted and adjusted logistic regression model of factors associated with maternal deaths
among hospital in Ethiopia, 2015
Table 9.1: Characteristics of the respondents, perceptions of midwives on the quality of emergency

obstetric care at hospitals in	n Harari region.	eastern Ethiopia, 2019	146

### LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1: Trends in MMR of the world, sub-Sahara Africa, and Ethiopia from 2000 to 20172
Figure 1.2: Severe obstetric outcome: the definition of maternal near miss and maternal deaths 3
Figure 1.3: Geographic Map of Ethiopia, showing the nine regional states and two city administrations
Figure 1.4: The three-tier health care delivery system of Ethiopia
Figure 1.5: Trends of maternal health service utilization over the last two decades in Ethiopia 15
Figure 1.6: Trends of maternal mortality ratio in Ethiopia from 2000 to 2016
Figure 1.7: The Three-Delay Model
Figure 3.1: The Three-Delay Model
Figure 3.2: PRISMA flow diagram indicating screening of the articles
Figure 3.3: Distribution of the included articles by country in which they were conducted
Figure 4.1: PRISMA flow diagram showing the selection of the included articles
Figure 4.2: Random effect meta-analysis level of women's knowledge about obstetric danger signs
during pregnancy in Ethiopia
Figure 4.3: Random effect meta-analysis level of women's knowledge about obstetric danger signs
during delivery in Ethiopia
Figure 4.4: Random effect meta-analysis level of women's knowledge about obstetric danger signs
during postpartum in Ethiopia
Figure 4.5: Level of women's knowledge about obstetric signs during pregnancy based on the number
of danger signs women mentioned
Figure 4.6: Regional variation of level of women's knowledge about obstetric danger signs during
pregnancy66
Figure 4.7: Subgroup analysis for level of knowledge about obstetric danger signs during pregnancy
among studies conducted at facility and community
Figure 5.1: Diagramatic presentation of the health facilities included in to the study
Figure 6.1: Distribution of Ethiopian hospitals by their ability in provision of signal functions of
emergency obstetric care, 2015
Figure 6.2: Morbidity and mortality due to indirect maternal complications among hospitals in Ethiopia,
2015
Figure 7.1: Causes of death among women who had CS in hospitals in Ethiopia in 2015 118
Figure 7.2: The correlation of maternal mortality ratio and caesarean section rate in Ethiopia, 2015119
Figure 8.1: The number of childbirth, mode of delivery and number of women who experienced
obstetric complications at hospitals in Ethiopia, 2015

#### **ABBREVIATIONS**

AFI Acute Febrile Illness

AIDS Acquired Immunodeficiency Syndrome
AMDD Averting Maternal Death and Disability

AMTSL Active Management of Third Stage of Labour

ANC Antenatal Care

ART Antiretroviral Therapy
AVD Assisted Vaginal Delivery

BEmOC Basic Emergency Obstetric Care

BMC Biomedical Central

CEmOC Comprehensive Emergency Obstetric Care

CINHAL Cumulative Index to Nursing and Allied Health Literature

CS Caesarean Section

DOCFR Direct Obstetric Case Fatality Rate

EDHS Ethiopian Demographic and Health Survey

EMA Ethiopian Midwives Association

EmOC Emergency Obstetric Care

EmONC Emergency Obstetric and Newborn Care

EPHI Ethiopian Public Health Institute

GDP Gross Domestic Product

GTP Growth and Transformation Plan

HC Health Centre

HCW Health Care Worker

HEW Health Extension Worker

HIV Human Immunodeficiency Virus

HP Health Post

HSTP Health Sector Transformation Plan

ICD International Classification of Diseases

JBI Joanna Briggs Institute

JHPIEGO Johns Hopkins Program for International Education in Gynaecology and Obstetrics

LTCs Life-Threatening Complications
MDG Millennium Development Goal

MDSR Maternal Death Surveillance and Response

MI Mortality Index

MMAT Mixed Method Appraisal Tool

MMR Maternal Mortality Ratio

MNM Maternal Near Miss

MNMIR Maternal Near Miss Incidence Ratio

MOH Ministry of Health

MOOSE Meta-Analysis of Observational Studies in Epidemiology

NGO Non-Governmental Organization

PHCU Primary Health Care Unit

PICOS Participant Intervention Comparison Outcome Setting

PNC Postnatal Care

PRISMA Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses

PROSPERO Prospective Register of Systematic Reviews

SBA Skilled Birth Attendant

SDG Sustainable Development Goal

SNNPR Southern Nations, Nationalities and People's Region

SSA Sub-Saharan Africa

SVD Spontaneous Vaginal Delivery

TBA Traditional Birth Attendant

TLTL Too Little Too Late
TMTS Too Much Too Soon

TWG Technical Working Group

UN United Nations

UNIFPA United Nations Population Fund UNICEF United Nations Children's Fund

USD United States Dollar

WHO World Health Organization

KODE Knowledge of Obstetric Danger Signs in Ethiopia

**Introduction:** In sub-Saharan African countries, where two-thirds of global maternal deaths occur, obstetric complications remain the major health threat for women. Ethiopia is among the countries with the highest maternal deaths in the world. The high maternal mortality ratio is mainly attributed to poor access and quality of emergency obstetric care (EmOC). However, there is a scarcity of literature on the availability and quality of EmOC in Ethiopia. Therefore, this thesis aimed to assess the availability and quality of EmOC in health facilities in Ethiopia.

**Methods:** This thesis employed a mixed methods approach where a combination of systematic reviews, meta-analysis, quantitative and qualitative studies were conducted. Initially, systematic reviews and meta-analysis were conducted to identify barriers to access to and utilisation of EmOC, and women's knowledge about obstetric danger signs. Then, three quantitative studies were conducted using a representative dataset accessed from the Ethiopian Public Health Institute to determine the availability and quality of EmOC in hospitals. The data used in this thesis were collected in 2016 as part of a national assessment of emergency obstetric and newborn care in Ethiopia. Finally, a complementary qualitative study was conducted in hospitals to assess midwives' perceptions about the quality of EmOC.

Results: In SSA, several factors that were seen at all levels of care affected women's access to and utilisation of EmOC. The pooled random effect meta-analysis revealed that only 48%, 43% and 32% of women know about obstetric danger signs that could happen during pregnancy, delivery and the immediate postpartum period, respectively. This study also demonstrated that, at the national level, maternal near miss incidence ratio and mortality index were 20.8% and 0.64%, respectively. The overall maternal mortality ratio in Ethiopian hospitals was 149 (95% CI: 136–162) per 100,000 live births while the annual caesarean section rate and the DOCFR in hospitals were 20.3% (95% CI: 20.2–20.5) and 0.64% (95% CI: 0.58–0.70%) respectively. However, there were significant regional variations in the magnitudes of these indicators. The findings of the qualitative study also revealed that a shortage of health infrastructure, insufficiency in trained providers, a shortage of medical supplies and essential drugs and poor management of services delivery affected the quality of EmOC.

Conclusions: In sub-Saharan Africa, several interdependent barriers that exist at multiple levels—either at home, on the way to health facilities or at the facilities—hampered access to and utilisation of EmOC for women in need. The observed regional disparities in the DOCFR, maternal near miss incidence ratio and mortality index indicate regional variation in the quality of EmOC. This necessitates the equitable distribution of health resources, strengthening maternal health interventions and quality improvement initiatives to tackle the observed regional variations. There is also a need for holistic strategies, including improvements to healthcare systems and the socio-economic status of women.